

SURF CLUB WAIVER APPLICATION #265-R1

SUPPLEMENTAL INFORMATION REGARDING DISPROPORTIONATE COST

Dear Respective Chairs and Members of the Commission and Counsel:

As described and discussed in this application for a waiver of accessibility requirements, the Surf Club is a qualified historic structure and there are substantial technical hurdles to providing vertical accessibility to the Hemingway Office and the Observation Deck of the historic stair tower that provides the only means of access to the Hemingway Office from the accessible ground floor level. Since, however, it is not impossible to provide vertical accessibility if historic impact is not taken into account, the Owner asked his architect to prepare a design proposal to provide vertical accessibility to be prepared for the unlikely case that the SHPO does not issue a *threaten or destroy* consultation and finding, and asked his contractor to provide cost estimates to construct such a design. It turns out, as explained below and in the included supporting documents, that the cost to provide vertical accessibility to the Hemingway Office and Observation Deck of the historic is disproportionate to the cost of the alteration to the Hemingway Office.

In designing and constructing an elevator/LULA/Lift tower, the vertical travel distances from the accessible grade level to the finished floor level of the Hemingway Club, and from the finished floor level of the Hemingway Club to the observation deck on the Stair Tower are fixed. The vertical travel distance from the accessible ground level to the Hemingway Office finished floor level is approximately +18'-0". The vertical travel distance from the Hemingway Office finished floor level to the observation deck level of the Stair Tower is approximately +12'-3". **Therefore, the total vertical travel length to provide vertical accessibility to those levels and spaces that lack it is approximately +30'-3".**

The minimum size of elevator that can be used is governed by the Florida Elevator Code and the total travel distance:

... or in which the vertical distance between the bottom terminal landing and the top terminal landing exceeds 25 feet must be constructed to contain at least one passenger elevator that is operational and will accommodate an ambulance stretcher 76 inches long and 24 inches wide in the horizontal position.

§ 399.035(2), Fla. Stat.

This section supersedes all other state laws and regulations and local ordinances and rules affecting the accessibility of passenger elevators to the physically handicapped, and the standards established by this section may not be modified by municipal or county ordinance.

§ 399.035(4), Fla. Stat. Therefore, the means of vertical accessibility to be provided, if any, must be an elevator that will hold a stretcher, typically a 3500 lb. capacity elevator. Based on the above, please find below the construction cost estimates and analysis:

The cost estimate for the alteration to the Hemingway Office is approximately \$ 1,873,400. See Exhibit A.

The cost estimate for Thyssenkrupp Elevator Corporation equipment installed in hoistway tower to be constructed by contractor = \$154,433. See Exhibit B.

The cost estimate for Otis elevator equipment is approximately \$135,000. See Exhibit C.

The cost to construct the Hemingway Elevator Tower with ThyssenKrupp elevator equipment is approximately \$ 959,277.00. See Exhibit D.

The cost to construct the Hemingway Elevator Tower with Otis elevator equipment is approximately \$939,844.00. (This is based on the cost of the elevator tower including the ThyssenKrupp elevator equipment, with the cost of the ThyssenKrupp elevator subtracted out and the cost of the Otis equipment added in.)

Disproportionate Cost Calculation

The cost of the alteration to the Hemingway Office \approx \$ 1,873,400

The lower cost estimate to construct an elevator tower with elevator equipment to provide vertical accessibility from the accessible ground floor to the Hemingway Office and Stair Tower observation deck \approx \$ 939,844

Cost ratio: $\$939,844 / \$1,873,400 = \mathbf{50\%}$

Because the cost to provide vertical accessibility to the Hemingway Office and the Stair Tower observation deck is approximately 50% of the cost of the alteration to the Hemingway Office, the cost is disproportionate.